## STATE OF MICHIGAN COURT OF APPEALS

*In re* application of CONSUMERS ENERGY COMPANY for reconciliation of 2010 costs

T.E.S. FILER CITY STATION LIMITED PARTNERSHIP,

FOR PUBLICATION May 28, 2015

Appellant,

V

No. 314361 MPSC LC No. 00-016045-R

CONSUMERS ENERGY COMPANY,

Petitioner-Appellee,

and

MICHIGAN PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION and ATTORNEY GENERAL,

Appellees.

**Advance Sheets Version** 

*In re* application of CONSUMERS ENERGY COMPANY for reconciliation of 2011 costs

CADILLAC RENEWABLE ENERGY, LLC, GENESEE POWER STATION LIMITED PARTNERSHIP, GRAYLING GENERATING STATION LIMITED PARTNERSHIP, HILLMAN POWER COMPANY, T.E.S. FILER CITY STATION LIMITED PARTNERSHIP, VIKING ENERGY OF LINCOLN, INC., and VIKING ENERGY OF MCBAIN, INC.,

Appellants,

v

| MICHIGAN PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION | N | IICHIC | iΑN | <b>PUBL</b> | JC S | SERV | 'ICE | CON | IN | 1IS | SI | $\mathbf{O}$ | N |
|------------------------------------|---|--------|-----|-------------|------|------|------|-----|----|-----|----|--------------|---|
|------------------------------------|---|--------|-----|-------------|------|------|------|-----|----|-----|----|--------------|---|

Appellee,

No. 316868 MPSC LC No. 00-016432-R

and

CONSUMERS ENERGY COMPANY,

Petitioner-Appellee.

Advance Sheets Version

Before: RONAYNE KRAUSE, P.J., and WILDER and STEPHENS, JJ.

WILDER, J. (concurring in part and dissenting in part).

I join with the majority in the analysis and result reached in Part IV of the majority opinion which holds that MCL 460.6a(8) "should be construed to mean that annual adjustments to the \$1,000,000 cap shall be calculated by applying the CPI rate for the PSCR year at issue to the \$1,000,000 cap as adjusted in prior years, or by applying the cumulative CPI rate from 2009 forward to the \$1,000,000 cap." However, I respectfully disagree and dissent from the analysis and outcome reached in Part III of the majority opinion. Rather, I agree with Judge WHITBECK's dissent in *In re Application of Consumers Energy Co for Reconciliation of 2009 Costs*, 307 Mich App 32; 859 NW2d 216 (2014), and also would hold that the "NOx requirements were not implemented until 2009 because they were not effective until 2009," and that "[t]herefore, the exception in MCL 460.6a(8) applied to TES Filer." *Id.* at 55-56.

/s/ Kurtis T. Wilder